



**THE STATES assembled on Tuesday  
26th November 2019, at 09.30 a.m. under  
the Presidency of the Bailiff,  
Timothy John Le Cocq, Esquire.**

---

**His Excellency the Lieutenant Governor,  
Air Chief Marshall Sir Stephen Dalton, G.C.B., LL.D. (Hon.), D.Sc. (Hon.), B.Sc., F.R.Ae.S.,  
C.C.M.I. was present.**

---

All members were present at roll call with the exception of –

Senator Ian Joseph Gorst – absent on States business  
Senator Lyndon John Farnham – en défaut (défaut raised at 10.48 a.m.)  
Connétable Christopher Hugh Taylor of St. John – excused attendance (arrived in the Chamber at 2.17 p.m.)  
Deputy Judith Ann Martin of St. Helier – en défaut (défaut raised at 10.08 a.m.)  
Deputy Mary Rose Le Hegarat of St. Helier – absent on States business

---

Prayers

---

### **Documents presented**

Financial Management and Internal Control (R.121/2019): Executive response. R.121/2019.  
Presented: 26th November 2019. Res.  
*Public Accounts Committee.*

### **Arrangement of public business for the present meeting**

THE STATES noted that, in accordance with Standing Order 34(1), the Council of Ministers had informed the Greffier of the States that the amendment (P.71/2019 Amd.(18)Amd.) to the amendment of the Corporate Services Scrutiny Panel (P.71/2019 Amd.(18)) to the proposition of the Council of Ministers entitled ‘Government Plan 2020–2023’ (P.71/2019) had been withdrawn.

### **Statements on a matter of official responsibility**

*(see Official Report/Hansard)*

The Chief Minister made a statement regarding the proposition of the Council of Ministers entitled ‘Government Plan 2020–2023’ (P.71/2019).

### **Government Plan 2020–2023 P.71/2019**

THE STATES commenced consideration of a proposition of the Council of Ministers entitled ‘Government Plan 2020–2023’ (P.71/2019) and, adopting an amendment of the Council of Ministers (P.71/2019 Amd.(22)), agreed that –

in paragraph (c), after the words “of the Report” there should be inserted the words “, except that, in Summary Table 3(i) the Head of Expenditure for Reserve for centrally held items should be decreased by £1,400,000, with other affected lines in Summary Table 3(i) to be amended accordingly”; and

in paragraph (g), after the words “to the Report” there should be inserted the words “, except that, in Summary Table 7 the transfer from Consolidated Fund to Stabilisation Fund should be amended to £28,000,000, with other affected lines in Summary Table 7 to be amended accordingly”.

THE STATES resumed consideration of the proposition of the Council of Ministers, as amended, and rejected an amendment of the Environment, Housing and Infrastructure Scrutiny Panel (P.71/2019 Amd.(4)) that –

in paragraph (a), after the words “Article 9(2)(a) of the Law” there should be inserted the words –

“, except that the 2020 Estimate for “Impôt Duties Fuel” shall be decreased by £1 million, by increasing road fuel duty by 4 pence per litre (and not 6 pence per litre as originally proposed)”;

in paragraph (c), after the words “of the Report” there should be inserted the words –

“, except that, in Summary Table 3(i), the Head of Expenditure for “Treasury and Exchequer” shall be decreased by £1 million, by reducing the level of the transfer to the Climate Emergency Fund by £1 million, with other affected lines in Summary Table 3(i) to be amended accordingly”; and

in paragraph (f)(ii), after the words “Summary Table 6 to the Report” there should be inserted the words –

“, except that, in Summary Table 6, the 2020 Estimated Income for the Climate Emergency Fund shall be reduced by £1 million, by reducing the level of the transfer from the Treasury and Exchequer Head of Expenditure, with the Closing balance in Summary Table 6 to be amended accordingly”.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 14**

Senator S.C. Ferguson  
 Senator K.L. Moore  
 Senator S.W. Pallett  
 Connétable of St. Helier  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of Grouville  
 Connétable of Trinity  
 Connétable of St. Peter  
 Deputy K.F. Morel (L)  
 Deputy S.M. Ahier (H)  
 Deputy J.H. Perchard (S)  
 Deputy K.G. Pamplin (S)  
 Deputy I. Gardiner (H)

**CONTRE: 32**

Senator L.J. Farnham  
 Senator J.A.N. Le Fondré  
 Senator T.A. Vallois  
 Senator S.Y. Mézec  
 Connétable of St. Clement  
 Connétable of St. Lawrence  
 Connétable of St. Mary  
 Connétable of St. Ouen  
 Connétable of St. Martin  
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)  
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)  
 Deputy of Grouville  
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)  
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)  
 Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)  
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)  
 Deputy S.J. Pinel (C)  
 Deputy of St. Martin  
 Deputy of St. Ouen  
 Deputy L.M.C. Doublet (S)  
 Deputy R. Labey (H)

**ABSTAIN: 0**

Deputy S.M. Wickenden (H)  
 Deputy of St. Mary  
 Deputy G.J. Truscott (B)  
 Deputy J.H. Young (B)  
 Deputy L.B.E. Ash (C)  
 Deputy G.C.U. Guida (L)  
 Deputy of St. Peter  
 Deputy of Trinity  
 Deputy of St. John  
 Deputy R.J. Ward (H)  
 Deputy C.S. Alves (H)

THE STATES, resuming consideration of the proposition of the Council of Ministers, as amended, commenced consideration of an amendment of Deputy Robert James Ward of St. Helier (P.71/2019 Amd.(10)) and rejected paragraph 1 of an amendment of Deputy Kirsten Francis Morel of St. Lawrence (P.71/2019 Amd.(10)Amd.) that, before the inserted sub-paragraph (a), for the words “except that”, there should be substituted the words “and that”; and that, in the inserted sub-paragraph (a), for the words “in Summary Table 1 the total income from ‘Goods and Services Tax (GST)’ should be increased by the sum of £712,500, by increasing the rate of GST levied on luxury cars (defined as those with an import or retail value over £30,000) to 10%”, there should be substituted the words “in time for 1st January 2021, the Minister for Treasury and Resources be requested to bring forward plans to levy an increased rate of GST of 10% on heavy domestic cars (defined as those with a weight over 1,950 kg.)”.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 9**

Connétable of St. Lawrence  
 Connétable of Grouville  
 Deputy L.M.C. Doublet (S)  
 Deputy of St. Mary  
 Deputy K.F. Morel (L)  
 Deputy G.C.U. Guida (L)  
 Deputy of Trinity  
 Deputy J.H. Perchard (S)  
 Deputy K.G. Pamplin (S)

**CONTRE: 38**

Senator L.J. Farnham  
 Senator S.C. Ferguson  
 Senator J.A.N. Le Fondré  
 Senator T.A. Vallois  
 Senator K.L. Moore  
 Senator S.W. Pallett  
 Senator S.Y. Mézec  
 Connétable of St. Helier  
 Connétable of St. Clement  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of St. John  
 Connétable of Trinity  
 Connétable of St. Peter  
 Connétable of St. Mary  
 Connétable of St. Ouen  
 Connétable of St. Martin  
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)  
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)  
 Deputy of Grouville  
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)  
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)  
 Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)  
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)  
 Deputy S.J. Pinel (C)  
 Deputy of St. Martin  
 Deputy of St. Ouen  
 Deputy R. Labey (H)  
 Deputy S.M. Wickenden (H)

**ABSTAIN: 0**

Deputy G.J. Truscott (B)  
 Deputy J.H. Young (B)  
 Deputy L.B.E. Ash (C)  
 Deputy of St. Peter  
 Deputy of St. John  
 Deputy S.M. Ahier (H)  
 Deputy R.J. Ward (H)  
 Deputy C.S. Alves (H)  
 Deputy I. Gardiner (H)

THE STATES rejected paragraph 2 of the amendment of Deputy Kirsten Francis Morel of St. Lawrence to the amendment of Deputy Robert James Ward of St. Helier (P.71/2019 Amd.(10)Amd.) that, in the inserted sub-paragraph (a), the words “, with the additional income transferred to the Climate Emergency Fund” should be deleted.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 12**

Senator J.A.N. Le Fondré  
 Senator K.L. Moore  
 Senator S.W. Pallett  
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)  
 Deputy S.J. Pinel (C)  
 Deputy of St. Ouen  
 Deputy of St. Mary  
 Deputy L.B.E. Ash (C)  
 Deputy K.F. Morel (L)  
 Deputy of Trinity  
 Deputy S.M. Ahier (H)  
 Deputy K.G. Pamplin (S)

**CONTRE: 33**

Senator L.J. Farnham  
 Senator S.C. Ferguson  
 Senator T.A. Vallois  
 Senator S.Y. Mézec  
 Connétable of St. Clement  
 Connétable of St. Lawrence  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of Grouville  
 Connétable of St. John  
 Connétable of Trinity  
 Connétable of St. Peter  
 Connétable of St. Mary  
 Connétable of St. Ouen  
 Connétable of St. Martin  
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)  
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)  
 Deputy of Grouville  
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)  
 Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)  
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)  
 Deputy of St. Martin  
 Deputy L.M.C. Doublet (S)  
 Deputy R. Labey (H)  
 Deputy S.M. Wickenden (H)  
 Deputy G.J. Truscott (B)  
 Deputy J.H. Young (B)  
 Deputy G.C.U. Guida (L)  
 Deputy of St. John  
 Deputy J.H. Perchard (S)  
 Deputy R.J. Ward (H)  
 Deputy C.S. Alves (H)  
 Deputy I. Gardiner (H)

**ABSTAIN:**

THE STATES, adopting paragraph 3 of the amendment of Deputy Kirsten Francis Morel of St. Lawrence to the amendment of Deputy Robert James Ward of St. Helier (P.71/2019 Amd.(10)Amd.), agreed that, in the inserted sub-paragraph (b)(vii), after the words “installation of” there should be inserted the words “air and”.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 39**

Senator L.J. Farnham  
 Senator J.A.N. Le Fondré  
 Senator T.A. Vallois  
 Senator K.L. Moore  
 Senator S.W. Pallett  
 Senator S.Y. Mézec  
 Connétable of St. Helier  
 Connétable of St. Clement  
 Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of Grouville  
 Connétable of Trinity  
 Connétable of St. Peter  
 Connétable of St. Ouen  
 Connétable of St. Martin  
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)  
 Deputy of Grouville  
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)  
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)  
 Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)  
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)  
 Deputy S.J. Pinel (C)  
 Deputy of St. Martin  
 Deputy of St. Ouen  
 Deputy L.M.C. Doublet (S)  
 Deputy of St. Mary  
 Deputy G.J. Truscott (B)  
 Deputy J.H. Young (B)  
 Deputy L.B.E. Ash (C)  
 Deputy K.F. Morel (L)  
 Deputy G.C.U. Guida (L)  
 Deputy of St. Peter  
 Deputy of Trinity  
 Deputy of St. John  
 Deputy S.M. Ahier (H)  
 Deputy J.H. Perchard (S)  
 Deputy R.J. Ward (H)  
 Deputy C.S. Alves (H)  
 Deputy K.G. Pamplin (S)  
 Deputy I. Gardiner (H)

**CONTRE: 8**

Senator S.C. Ferguson  
 Connétable of St. Lawrence  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Connétable of St. John  
 Connétable of St. Mary  
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)  
 Deputy R. Labey (H)  
 Deputy S.M. Wickenden (H)

**ABSTAIN: 0**

THE STATES, resuming consideration of the amendment of Deputy Robert James Ward of St. Helier (P.71/2019 Amd.(10)), as amended, rejected paragraph (a) of the amendment that, after the words “of the Law” there, should be inserted the words –

“, except that in Summary Table 1 the total income from ‘Goods and Services Tax (GST)’ should be increased by the sum of £712,500, by increasing the rate of GST levied on luxury cars (defined as those with an import or retail value over £30,000) to 10%, with the additional income transferred to the Climate Emergency Fund; and”.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 14**

Senator S.Y. Mézec  
 Connétable of St. Helier  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Connétable of St. Peter  
 Connétable of St. Martin  
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)  
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)  
 Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)  
 Deputy J.H. Young (B)  
 Deputy of St. John  
 Deputy J.H. Perchard (S)  
 Deputy R.J. Ward (H)  
 Deputy C.S. Alves (H)  
 Deputy K.G. Pamplin (S)

**CONTRE: 33**

Senator L.J. Farnham  
 Senator S.C. Ferguson  
 Senator J.A.N. Le Fondré  
 Senator T.A. Vallois  
 Senator K.L. Moore  
 Senator S.W. Pallett  
 Connétable of St. Clement  
 Connétable of St. Lawrence  
 Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of Grouville  
 Connétable of St. John  
 Connétable of Trinity  
 Connétable of St. Mary  
 Connétable of St. Ouen  
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)  
 Deputy of Grouville  
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)  
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)  
 Deputy S.J. Pinel (C)  
 Deputy of St. Martin  
 Deputy of St. Ouen  
 Deputy L.M.C. Doublet (S)  
 Deputy R. Labey (H)  
 Deputy S.M. Wickenden (H)  
 Deputy of St. Mary  
 Deputy G.J. Truscott (B)  
 Deputy L.B.E. Ash (C)  
 Deputy K.F. Morel (L)  
 Deputy G.C.U. Guida (L)  
 Deputy of St. Peter  
 Deputy of Trinity  
 Deputy S.M. Ahier (H)  
 Deputy I. Gardiner (H)

**ABSTAIN: 0**

THE STATES, adopting paragraph (b) of the amendment of Deputy Robert James Ward of St. Helier (P.71/2019 Amd.(10)), as amended, agreed that, after the words “of the Law” there, should be inserted the words –

“, except that the Minister for Treasury and Resource is requested to publish an estimate of the effect on General Tax Revenue of decreasing the rate of GST levied on –

- (i) solar panels,
- (ii) electric space heating replacement of oil heating,
- (iii) electric cars, motorbikes, scooters and vans,

- (iv) electric bikes and cargo bikes,
- (v) loft and cavity wall insulation,
- (vi) double glazing, and
- (vii) installation of air and ground source heating to 0%, so that the Assembly can consider the financial effects of zero-rating those items in the Government Plan 2021”.”.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 38**

Senator L.J. Farnham  
 Senator J.A.N. Le Fondré  
 Senator T.A. Vallois  
 Senator K.L. Moore  
 Senator S.W. Pallett  
 Senator S.Y. Mézec  
 Connétable of St. Helier  
 Connétable of St. Clement  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of Trinity  
 Connétable of St. Peter  
 Connétable of St. Ouen  
 Connétable of St. Martin  
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)  
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)  
 Deputy of Grouville  
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)  
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)  
 Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)  
 Deputy S.J. Pinel (C)  
 Deputy of St. Martin  
 Deputy L.M.C. Doublet (S)  
 Deputy R. Labey (H)  
 Deputy of St. Mary  
 Deputy G.J. Truscott (B)  
 Deputy J.H. Young (B)  
 Deputy L.B.E. Ash (C)  
 Deputy K.F. Morel (L)  
 Deputy G.C.U. Guida (L)  
 Deputy of St. Peter  
 Deputy of St. John  
 Deputy S.M. Ahier (H)  
 Deputy J.H. Perchard (S)  
 Deputy R.J. Ward (H)  
 Deputy C.S. Alves (H)  
 Deputy K.G. Pamplin (S)  
 Deputy I. Gardiner (H)

**CONTRE: 8**

Senator S.C. Ferguson  
 Connétable of St. Lawrence  
 Connétable of Grouville  
 Connétable of St. John  
 Connétable of St. Mary  
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)  
 Deputy S.M. Wickenden (H)  
 Deputy of Trinity

**ABSTAIN: 1**

Deputy of St. Ouen

**Arrangement of public business for the present meeting**

THE STATES rejected a proposition of the Chair of the Privileges and Procedures Committee that consideration of public business continue until 6.30 p.m. at which time the Assembly would adjourn.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 17**

Connétable of St. Helier  
 Connétable of St. Clement  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Connétable of Grouville  
 Connétable of St. Peter  
 Connétable of St. Martin  
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)  
 Deputy of Grouville  
 Deputy of St. Martin  
 Deputy R. Labey (H)  
 Deputy S.M. Wickenden (H)  
 Deputy of St. Mary  
 Deputy G.J. Truscott (B)  
 Deputy of St. Peter  
 Deputy of St. John  
 Deputy S.M. Ahier (H)  
 Deputy K.G. Pamplin (S)

**CONTRE: 29**

Senator L.J. Farnham  
 Senator S.C. Ferguson  
 Senator J.A.N. Le Fondré  
 Senator T.A. Vallois  
 Senator K.L. Moore  
 Senator S.W. Pallett  
 Senator S.Y. Mézec  
 Connétable of St. Lawrence  
 Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of St. John  
 Connétable of Trinity  
 Connétable of St. Mary  
 Connétable of St. Ouen  
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)  
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)  
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)  
 Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)  
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)  
 Deputy S.J. Pinel (C)  
 Deputy of St. Ouen  
 Deputy L.M.C. Doublet (S)  
 Deputy J.H. Young (B)  
 Deputy L.B.E. Ash (C)  
 Deputy K.F. Morel (L)  
 Deputy of Trinity  
 Deputy J.H. Perchard (S)  
 Deputy R.J. Ward (H)  
 Deputy C.S. Alves (H)  
 Deputy I. Gardiner (H)

**ABSTAIN: 0****Government Plan 2020–2023 P.71/2019**

THE STATES, resuming consideration of the proposition of the Council of Ministers entitled ‘Government Plan 2020–2023’ (P.71/2019), as amended, rejected an amendment of the Deputy of St. Peter (P.71/2019 Amd.(13)), that, in paragraph (a), after the words “Article 9(2)(a) of the Law” there should be inserted the words “, except that the 2020 Estimate for “Impôt Duties” shall be decreased by £1.05 million, by restricting increases in impôt duties on alcohol to RPI (2.7%) across the board”.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 14**

Senator S.C. Ferguson  
 Connétable of St. Helier  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Connétable of St. Brelade

**CONTRE: 29**

Senator J.A.N. Le Fondré  
 Senator T.A. Vallois  
 Senator K.L. Moore  
 Senator S.W. Pallett

**ABSTAIN: 0**



Connétable of Trinity	Senator S.Y. Mézec
Connétable of St. Peter	Connétable of St. Clement
Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)	Connétable of St. Lawrence
Deputy R. Labey (H)	Connétable of Grouville
Deputy L.B.E. Ash (C)	Connétable of St. Mary
Deputy of St. Peter	Connétable of St. Ouen
Deputy of St. John	Connétable of St. Martin
Deputy S.M. Ahier (H)	Deputy J.A. Martin (H)
Deputy C.S. Alves (H)	Deputy G.P. Southern (H)
Deputy K.G. Pamplin (S)	Deputy of Grouville
	Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)
	Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)
	Deputy S.J. Pinel (C)
	Deputy of St. Martin
	Deputy of St. Ouen
	Deputy L.M.C. Doublet (S)
	Deputy of St. Mary
	Deputy G.J. Truscott (B)
	Deputy J.H. Young (B)
	Deputy K.F. Morel (L)
	Deputy G.C.U. Guida (L)
	Deputy of Trinity
	Deputy J.H. Perchard (S)
	Deputy R.J. Ward (H)
	Deputy I. Gardiner (H)

### **Adjournment**

THE STATES adjourned, having agreed to reconvene on Wednesday 27th November 2019 to continue consideration of the proposition of the Council of Ministers entitled ‘Government Plan 2020–2023’ (P.71/2019), as amended, and accompanying amendments and the other outstanding items of public business.

THE STATES rose at 5.31 p.m.

**L.-M. HART**

*Deputy Greffier of the States*